APPLYING A COLLEGE VALUE FRAMEWORK TO DECISION-MAKING

Tribal Colleges and Universities Convening

Princeton, New Jersey

August 2017
OVERVIEW OF DISCUSSION

- Share results from the Gallup- USA Funds Associate Degree Graduates and Minority Graduate Report.

- Discuss implications from the reports for tribal colleges.

- Provide recommendations on actions tribal college administrators may consider to enhance college value.
Economic Imperative

By 2020, 65% of all jobs will require postsecondary education and training beyond high school.

At current attainment rates, the U.S. will fall short by 5MM workers with postsecondary education by 2020.

At the same time, we currently have 5MM disconnected youth – young adults neither working or in school.
Skills Gap

Despite a high unemployment rate, employers say they lack qualified job applicants.

99% of colleges agree their institution is very or somewhat effective in preparing students for the world of work.

11% of employers strongly agree that higher education institutions are graduating students with the skills and competencies their business needs.

13% of all Americans agree that higher education institutions are graduating students with the skills and competencies employers need.
COLLEGE VALUE
DEFINING ROI

STUDENT INVESTMENT
- Tuition
- Room & Board
- Foregone Wages
- Time
- Debt

STUDENT RETURN
- Job Placement
- Wages
- Job & Personal Satisfaction
- Health
- Further Education

STATE / TAXPAYER INVESTMENT
- Increased Tax Revenue
- Increased State Appropriations
- Increased Enrollment Rates
- Increased College Enrollment Rates
- Less Crime
- Less Criminal Activity

STATE / TAXPAYER RETURN
- Increased Research
- Increased Capital Outlay
- Increased Accountability
- Increased Development
- Increased Infrastructure

INCREASED APPROPRIATIONS
- Higher Pay
- Better Jobs
- Higher Wages
WHAT ARE EMPLOYERS SAYING ABOUT THE WORKFORCE PREPAREDNESS OF GRADUATES?

AAC&U conducted an online survey among 400 executives at private-sector and nonprofit organizations that have 25 or more employees

- Each reports that 25% or more of their new hires hold an associate degree from a two-year college or a bachelor’s degree from a four-year college

Online survey among 613 college students, all within a year of obtaining a degree or, in the case of two-year students, transferring to a four-year college

- Sample includes 304 students at four-year public colleges, 151 students at four-year private colleges, and 158 students at two-year colleges
LEARNING OUTCOMES THAT AT LEAST FOUR IN FIVE EMPLOYERS RATE AS VERY IMPORTANT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skill</th>
<th>Employers</th>
<th>Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral communication</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working effectively with others in teams</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written communication</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical judgment and decision-making</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical/analytical thinking</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Applying knowledge/skills to real world</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*8, 9, 10 ratings on zero-to-10 scale, 10 = very important
EMPLOYERS PERCEIVE THERE IS ROOM TO IMPROVE COLLEGE STUDENTS’ PREPAREDNESS TO COMPLETE APPLIED LEARNING PROJECTS.

Colleges should ensure that students are prepared with skills/knowledge needed to complete an applied learning project

- 14% of employers think college students are prepared
- 88% of employers think these attributes are important

Recent graduates should be able to demonstrate and apply learning to real-world settings

- 23% of employers think college students are prepared
- 80% of employers think these attributes are important

60% of employers believe that ALL college students should be expected to complete a significant applied learning project before graduating.
## Attributes Employers Seek on a Candidate’s Resume

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>% of Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Leadership</td>
<td>80.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to work in a team</td>
<td>78.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication skills (written)</td>
<td>70.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem-solving skills</td>
<td>70.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication skills (verbal)</td>
<td>68.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strong work ethic</td>
<td>68.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initiative</td>
<td>65.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analytical/quantitative skills</td>
<td>62.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flexibility/adaptability</td>
<td>60.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical skills</td>
<td>59.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpersonal skills (relates well to others)</td>
<td>58.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer skills</td>
<td>55.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detail-oriented</td>
<td>52.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Job Outlook 2016, National Association of Colleges and Employers*
KEY INSIGHT

*There is a disconnect between how students define success and how institutions define success.*

**Question:** How many of you know that your college’s definition of student success includes post-college outcomes for students?
THE GOAL: IMPROVING EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES

Reasons To Go To College

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>Very Important</th>
<th>Important</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To improve my employment opportunities</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To make more money</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To get a good job</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To learn more about a favorite topic or area of interest</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To become a better person</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To improve my self-confidence</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To learn more about the world</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To make a better life for my children</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To set an example for my children</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To switch jobs or change careers</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To meet new people</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My parents wanted me to go</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: New America’s College Decision Survey 2015
GROUP EXERCISE

1. How does your college define student success?

2. How do your students define student success? Is there a disconnect?

3. How well do you know your students voices?

4. Do you know how well your students are being placed into jobs?

5. Do you know how satisfied your graduates are with their experience at your college?

6. How do you know your academic programs are providing students with the skills that employers desire?

7. Do you use earnings to determine the value of your degree programs in terms of students’ careers?

Not at all 1 ------------ 5 ------------ 10 Very well
HIGHLIGHTS FROM SURVEY OF ASSOCIATE DEGREE HOLDERS

- Based on interviews with random sample of 2,548 adults whose highest level education is an associate degree.
- Participants: 18 years+ old, with internet access, living in all 50 U.S. states and D.C.
- Surveys conducted March 19 - May 11, 2015.
- Comparisons with 30,151 bachelor’s-degree holders surveyed as part of Gallup-Purdue Index.
SAMPLE GALLUP QUESTION

I wouldn’t be where I am today without my [highest level of education]

- High School Diploma/GED
- Technical/vocational Degree
- Some college no degree
- College Degree (bachelors degree)
- Post-graduae work/Degree
I WOULDN’T BE WHERE I AM TODAY WITHOUT MY [HIGHEST LEVEL OF EDUCATION].
EMPLOYMENT STATUS

- % Associate Degree Holders
- % Bachelor's Degree Holders

- Employed Full Time (Employer): 49, 56
- Employed Full Time (Self): 4, 4
- Employed Part Time, Do Not Want Full Time: 11, 10
- Unemployed: 5, 4
- Employed Part Time, Want Full Time: 7, 5
- Not in Workforce: 24, 21
HAD JOB OR INTERNSHIP RELATED TO FIELD THEY WERE STUDYING

(Among Associate Degree Holders who had a paid job or internship)

64% YES
36% NO
WHAT DOES A “GREAT LIFE” LOOK LIKE?

Purpose Well-Being:
Liking what you do each day and being motivated to achieve your goals

Social Well-Being:
Having strong and supportive relationships and love in your life

Financial Well-Being
Effectively managing your economic life to reduce stress and increase security

Community Well-Being
The sense of engagement you have with the areas where you live, liking where you live, and feeling safe and having pride in your community

Physical Well-Being
Having good health and enough energy to get things done on a daily basis
Across all five elements, associate degree holders are most likely to be thriving in purpose well-being (42%) and social well-being (40%).
PERCENT THRIVING IN WELL-BEING

% Thriving Associate Degree Holders

- Purpose Well-Being: 42
- Social Well-Being: 40
- Financial Well-Being: 27
- Community Well-Being: 35
- Physical Well-Being: 25

% Thriving Bachelor's Degree Holders

- Purpose Well-Being: 49
- Social Well-Being: 47
- Financial Well-Being: 41
- Community Well-Being: 44
- Physical Well-Being: 32
If graduates strongly agree that they were “emotionally supported” during college, the odds that they are engaged in their work and thriving in their overall well-being double.
PERCENT STRONGLY AGREE

My professors/instructors at COLLEGE cared about me as a person.

30% ASSOCIATE DEGREE HOLDERS

26% BACHELOR’S DEGREE HOLDERS

I had at least one professor/instructor at COLLEGE who made me excited about learning.

56% ASSOCIATE DEGREE HOLDERS

61% BACHELOR’S DEGREE HOLDERS

While attending COLLEGE, I had a mentor who encouraged me to pursue my goals and dreams.

20% ASSOCIATE DEGREE HOLDERS

18% BACHELOR’S DEGREE HOLDERS

Strongly agree with all three.

13% ASSOCIATE DEGREE HOLDERS

12% BACHELOR’S DEGREE HOLDERS
## SUPPORT BY MAJORS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Business</th>
<th>Computer and Information Services</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Engineering Technologies and Engineering-Related Fields</th>
<th>Health Professions and Related Programs</th>
<th>Liberal Arts and Sciences, General Studies and Humanities</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My professors/instructors at COLLEGE cared about me as a person.</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I had at least one professor/instructor at COLLEGE who made me excited about learning.</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>While attending COLLEGE, I had a mentor who encouraged me to pursue my goals and dreams.</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree with all three.</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
If graduates strongly agree that they were “emotionally supported” during college, the odds that they are engaged in their work and thriving in their overall well-being double.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Yes (%)</th>
<th>No (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Have you ever considered enrolling in a four-year degree-granting program? (Among Associate Degree Holders)</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did you enroll in a four-year degree-granting program after you completed your associate degree? (Among Associate Degree Holders who considered enrolling in a four-year degree-granting program)</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IMPLICATIONS

Curriculum Considerations
– Infuse all subject areas with significant experiential learning and employer engagement.

Smoother Transfer Process
Provide more flexible, affordable opportunities to pursue four-year degree; strengthen partnerships between two-year, four-year colleges and universities

Program Offerings and Student Advising
– Emphasize programs that lead to employment in fields that are in high demand by employers and result in financially rewarding careers.
Associate-degree-only graduates (46%) are as likely as their bachelor-degree-only peers (45%) to strongly agree that their education was worth the cost.
MY EDUCATION WAS WORTH THE COST.

- 1 Strongly Agree
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5 Strongly Disagree

**Associate Degree Holders**
- 16% strongly disagree
- 7% agree
- 6% strongly agree

**Bachelor’s Degree Holders**
- 28% strongly disagree
- 7% agree
- 14% strongly agree

GALLUP
EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING OPPORTUNITIES

% Strongly agree

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer and Information Services</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering Technologies and Engineering-Related Fields</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Professions and Related Programs</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberal Arts and Sciences, General Studies and Humanities</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While attending UNIVERSITY to complete my associate degree, I had an internship or job that allowed me to apply what I was learning in the classroom.

GALLUP
Curriculum Considerations
– Infuse all subject areas with significant experiential learning and employer engagement.

Smother Transfer Process
– Provide more flexible, affordable opportunities to pursue four-year degree; strengthen partnerships between two-year, four-year colleges and universities.

Program Offerings and Student Advising
– Emphasize programs that lead to employment in fields that are in high demand by employers and result in financially rewarding careers.
HIGHLIGHTS FROM SURVEY OF MINORITY GRADUATES

- Based on interviews with random sample of 55,000 adults who received bachelor’s degrees between 1940 and 2015.
- Participants: 18 years+ old, with internet access, living in all 50 U.S. states and D.C.
If graduates strongly agree that they were “emotionally supported” during college, the odds that they are engaged in their work and thriving in their overall well-being double.
IT’S HOW YOU DO IT

“At least one professor who made me excited about learning” 64%

“Professors cared about me as a person” 27%

“A mentor who encouraged my goals and dreams” 22%

14% of all graduates experienced all three
IT’S HOW YOU DO IT

“Long-term project taking a semester or more to complete” 32%

“Internship or job where applied learning” 30%

“Extremely involved in extracurricular activities and organizations” 20%

6% of all graduates experienced all three

Copyright © 2016 Gallup, Inc. All rights reserved.
MY EDUCATION FROM [UNIVERSITY NAME] WAS WORTH THE COST.
Graduates who interacted with people from different backgrounds on a regular basis in college are 2.2x as likely to say their education was worth the cost.
# HBCUS Offer More Support and Experiential Learning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Support and Experiential Learning Opportunities</th>
<th>Black Graduates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>My professors at My University cared about me as a person.</strong></td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I had at least one professor at My University who made me excited about learning.</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>While attending My University, I had a mentor who encouraged me to pursue my goals and dreams.</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Felt Support</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>While attending My University, I had an internship or job that allowed me to apply what I was learning in the classroom.</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>While attending My University, I worked on a project that took a semester or more to complete.</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I was extremely active in extracurricular activities and organizations while attending My University.</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Experiential Learning</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Copyright © 2016 Gallup, Inc. All rights reserved.
## THE HSI EXPERIENCE MAY NOT OFFER THE SAME OPPORTUNITIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Support and Experiential Learning Opportunities</th>
<th>Hispanic Graduates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>HSIs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My professors at My University cared about me as a person.</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I had at least one professor at My University who made me excited about learning.</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>While attending My University, I had a mentor who encouraged me to pursue my goals and dreams.</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Felt Support</strong></td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>While attending My University, I had an internship or job that allowed me to apply what I was learning in the classroom.</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>While attending My University, I worked on a project that took a semester or more to complete.</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I was extremely active in extracurricular activities and organizations while attending My University.</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Experiential Learning</strong></td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Copyright © 2016 Gallup, Inc. All rights reserved.
### Support and Experiential Learning Opportunities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ivy</th>
<th>HBCU</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My professors at My University cared about me as a person.</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I had at least one professor at My University who made me excited about learning.</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>While attending My University, I had a mentor who encouraged me to pursue my goals and dreams.</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Felt Support**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ivy</th>
<th>HBCU</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>While attending My University, I had an internship or job that allowed me to apply what I was learning in the classroom.</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>While attending My University, I worked on a project that took a semester or more to complete.</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I was extremely active in extracurricular activities and organizations while attending My University.</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Experiential Learning**
CRITICAL QUESTIONS

1. How are tribal colleges preparing all students for the kinds of challenges they will confront in life, work and citizenship, both U.S. and global?

2. How can tribal colleges help students to integrate and apply their knowledge and skills to complex real-world and employer-based problems?

3. What role can tribal colleges play in addressing bridging the gap between employer needs and the competencies of their graduates?
STRATEGIES PRESIDENTS MAY PURSUE

1. Understand how your alumni benefited from their college experience.
2. Collaborate with employers to align your graduates’ skills with workplace demands.
3. Inform academic and career advising with labor market information.
4. Understand innovative new ways of delivering higher education.
5. Establish clear goals for improving student success and monitor your institution’s progress.
CRITICAL QUESTION

1. How will you as a president seek to improve college value at your institutions based on this presentation?

2. What are the implications for your college?

Engage in your small group and list three actions you will take as a result of this discussion.
FOR MORE INFORMATION

- Strada Education Network website: www.stradaeducation.org
- College Value website: www.collegevalue.net
- Strada Education Network on Twitter: @stradaeducation
- To register to receive our reports, visit stradaeducation.gallup.com
- To access reports: www.stradaeducation.org/consumer-insights